

STM 1975:2

From Pergolesi to Gallo by the Numericode system

Av Cari Johansson

© Denna text får ej mångfaldigas eller ytterligare publiceras utan tillstånd från författaren.

Upphovsrätten till de enskilda artiklarna ägs av resp. författare och Svenska samfundet för musikforskning. Enligt svensk lagstiftning är alla slags citat tillåtna inom ramen för en vetenskaplig eller kritisk framställning utan att upphovsrättsinnehavaren behöver tillfrågas. Det är också tillåtet att göra en kopia av enskilda artiklar för personligt bruk. Däremot är det inte tillåtet att kopiera hela databasen.

From Pergolesi to Gallo by the Numericode system

By Cari Johansson

Musicologists and music librarians know the difficulties that they have to face in identifying compositions from the 18th century. The works were to a large extent distributed in manuscripts (MSS). No effective copyright laws existed. Works both in print and MSS were often attributed to the wrong composers. It was of course easier to sell a work by a known composer than by an unknown one. One and the same work may be attributed to two, three and even more different authors in different MSS and editions from that time. Very often an analysis in detail would be necessary to establish, if possible, who is the author, a work too time-consuming for the librarian. The only possibility for him in these cases is to catalogue the different copies under one and the same composer with references from the others.

In order to facilitate the identification of music a thematic catalogue based on Ingmar Bengtsson's Numericode system¹ has been prepared at the Library of the Royal Swedish Academy of Music (Kungl Musikaliska akademins bibliotek), Stockholm. All MSS catalogued in Sweden for RISM and a great number of published thematic catalogues have been coded for our catalogue, which now (1975) contains some 57 000 incipits and has proved an invaluable tool for identification. It has enabled us to bring together identical works attributed to different composers in different copies. A great many anonymous works have been identified, and misattributions have been corrected. Hypotheses about false attributions have also been sup-

ported by names found on different copies. A case in point is the trio sonatas that were ascribed to Pergolesi but are now considered not to be by him.

The pre-Classical traits that are mixed with the late-Baroque style in the trio sonatas attributed to Pergolesi made him appear an early forerunner of the Vienna Classical school. As such he was regarded by Hugo Riemann and other scholars such as Radiciotti and Einstein, and as late as in 1964 by E L Stover.² But already in the 18th century were doubts of the authenticity of these sonatas expressed. Burney writes in his *General history of music*: "if the sonatas ascribed to Pergolesi, for two violins and a base, are genuine, which is much to be doubted".³ Charles L Cudworth too, at his examination of them in 1949, concluded that "it is not impossible but rather improbable, that they are Pergolesi's own compositions". According to Cudworth they would probably be the work of a slightly later composer than Pergolesi.⁴ In 1965 Cudworth also could support this hypothesis by MS copies of some of these sonatas in the library of the Marquess of Exeter and in the University of California at Berkeley, where they are attributed to "Signor Gallo".⁵ In his article in MGG H Huckle also declares that these sonatas are not genuine, and W S Newman is of the same opinion⁶ as is H Ulrich: "But since no more likely candidate for authorship has been put forward, we shall call the composer 'pseudo Pergolesi' here, with the hope that the question of authorship will be solved eventually."⁷

No autograph manuscript of these sonatas has been found, but on MS copies from the 18th century Pergolesi is indicated as the composer, and in 1766 one of them was entered under Pergolesi's name in the Breitkopf thematic catalogue. C 1770–71, i.e. some 35 years after Pergolesi's death, R Bremner in London published 12 trio sonatas under Pergolesi's name (nos 1–12 in Pergolesi's *Opera omnia: Sonate a tre*), later followed by two others (nos 13–14, *ibid*). According to an inscription on the title page of Bremner's edition of the 12 sonatas, the manuscript of them had been procured by "a Curious Gentleman of Fortune during his Trav-

els through Italy". Who this "Curious Gentleman of Fortune" was we do not know. We only know that in prints from the 1770s as well as in undated MSS the sonatas are attributed to Pergolesi, and that there are MSS at Berkeley and in the possession of the Marquess of Exeter with some of these sonatas attributed to Gallo.

At the cataloguing for RISM of the MSS in the Library of the Royal Swedish Academy of Music in Stockholm, two MSS copies of trio sonatas attributed to Domenico Gallo have been found. With the aid of the above-mentioned catalogue of incipits we found that these sonatas are identical with sonatas 1–12 in Pergolesi's *Opera omnia*, that four of them also are ascribed to Gallo in Italian MSS in the University of California at Berkeley⁸ and that the sonata no 6 has also been attributed to Domenico Ferrari and was published as Sonata no 2 in a collection of 6 sonatas by Ferrari and Campioni, first by Love c 1758, later by C & S Thompson in 1764.

The MSS in the Library of the Royal Swedish Academy of Music in Stockholm consist of a complete set of parts of the sonatas 1 and 3–12 entitled *Trio 1° (3°–12) | a Due violini e Basso | Del Sig^{re} / Domeneco [sic] Gallo*, and of a bass part (violin I and II are missing) of all twelve sonatas with the title *Sonata Prima (-12) | Basso | Dil [sic] Sig^r Dominico [sic] Gallo*. All these parts are from the second half of the 18th century, and written on north Italian paper. The complete set of parts (Sonata no 1 and nos 3–12) are written on so called Venetian paper with a watermark consisting of three halfmoons, a comet and F reversed F under a fleur-de-lys.⁹ The watermark of the bass part of the Sonata Prima (-12) is C [or G?] B at the lower right corner. This part is bound and on its first and last sheets are watermarks with the Genoa coat-of-arms, three shields above each other, a cross in the upper shield, SP in the middle shield, a griffin at each side of the upper shield and above the shields a crown.¹⁰ According to V D Kock the sonata attributed both to Ferrari and to Gallo, i.e. no 6 in Pergolesi's *Opera omnia*, differs from the other trio sonatas by Ferrari among other things in having a second movement in the subdominant key. In the other trio sonatas Ferrari retains the same key in all movements.¹¹ In Gallo's trio sonatas on the other hand all second movements except one change to a key that differs from the tonic in the first and the third movements. And in addition to the sonata ascribed both to Gallo and to Ferrari, 3 out of Gallo's 11 second movements change to the sub-

dominant. All twelve sonatas are also attributed to Gallo in two MSS (sonata no 2 that is lacking in one of the MSS in Stockholm appears in an MS at Berkeley) and some of them even in more. It is true that one of these sonatas has also been published under Ferrari's name, but as it differs from Ferrari's other trio sonatas and as it is ascribed to Gallo in at least three Italian MSS, two in Stockholm and one at Berkeley,¹² one can suspect, that here too we have to deal with a Ferrari forgery.

Very little is known about Domenico Gallo. The music dictionaries tell us only that he was born in Venice about 1730, that he was an eminent violinist and that he wrote church music, trio sonatas, symphonies and according to Gerber also violin concertos. In *RISM, Einzeldrucke vor 1800* vol 3, the following works are listed under his name: 6 Sonatas for two flutes and bass published in London and 6 Sonatas for two violins and bass published in Venice.¹³ 7 Sonate a tre are listed by Duckles and Elmer.¹⁴ The Breitkopf thematic catalogue from 1762 and 1767 lists '6 Parade Sinfonien' and 3 other symphonies under Gallo without a Christian name. But out of these 9 works 6 are identical with movements attributed to Alberto Gallo.¹⁵

Domenico Gallo apparently belonged to the pre-Classical Italian composers. He was born in Venice c 1730. If he is the author of these sonatas, which is most probable, they can hardly have been composed before the 1750s. Thanks to thematic catalogues it has been proved that the trio sonatas by pseudo Pergolesi are ascribed to Domenico Gallo in several Italian MSS. During the continued inventory for RISM of the MSS before 1800 it will perhaps become clear, if the problem concerning the authenticity of these sonatas has been solved or if still more names have to be considered.

⁸ Gallo 1 and 3–5 in V Duckles and M Elmer, *Thematic catalog of a manuscript collection of eighteenth-century Italian instrumental music ...* (Berkeley & Los Angeles, 1963), pp 102–103.

⁹ See WM 3 in V Duckles and M Elmer, *op cit*, p 19.

¹⁰ See 14 c in the article 'Watermarks and musicology' by J LaRue in *Acta musicologica*, XXXIII (1961), p 142.

¹¹ V D Kock, *The works of Domenico Ferrari (1722–1780)* (Tulane University, 1969).

¹² Whether the MS belonging to the Marquess of Exeter includes this sonata, I do not know.

¹³ The RISM secretariat in Kassel cannot yet give information about works in MSS.

¹⁴ *Op cit*, pp 102–104.

¹⁵ Cf R Haas, *Die Estensischen Musikalien. Thematisches Verzeichnis* (Regensburg, 1927), pp 169–170.

¹ I Bengtsson gives an account of this system in STM 49 (1967), pp 5–40.

² E L Stover, *The instrumental chamber music of Giovanni Battista Pergolesi* (Florida State University, 1964).

³ Dover ed (New York, 1957), vol 2, p 924.

⁴ *Music & Letters*, XXX (1949), pp 321–328.

⁵ *The Galpin Society journal*, XVIII (1965), p 141.

⁶ W S Newman, *The sonata in the Baroque era*, revised ed (Chapel Hill, 1966), pp 196–199.

⁷ H Ulrich, *Chamber music*, second ed (New York & London, 1966), p 136.